

FALKIRK COUNCIL

**Subject: EXECUTIVE RECOMMENDATIONS:
APPOINTMENT OF ELECTED MEMBERS TO OUTSIDE
ORGANISATIONS- SCRUTINY PANEL REVIEW**
Meeting: FALKIRK COUNCIL
Date: 17 DECEMBER 2014
Author: CHIEF GOVERNANCE OFFICER

1. PURPOSE

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to refer the Executive's recommendations in regard to a scrutiny panel review of the appointment of elected members to outside bodies to Council for consideration.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 As part of its workplan, the scrutiny committee established a scrutiny panel to review the appointment of elected members to outside organisations and the process for reporting to Council. The organisations covered by the panel's review did not include the following:-

- Central Scotland Valuation Joint Board (CSVJB)
- Cornton Vale Over 21s Visiting Committee
- Falkirk Community Trust Board
- Forth Valley NHS Board
- Fife and Forth Valley Community Justice Authority
- SEStran
- Central and West Lothian Area Support Team
- Scotland Excel

- 2.2 In the main, this was because these organisations have a statutory background, are part of partnership agreements or fall within the general exclusions referred to in the Councillors' Code of Conduct. The panel comprising, Provost Reid (Chair) and Councillors Black and McLuckie met on 3 occasions – 24 February, 12 June and 18 August 2014. It also conducted 3 surveys to inform its deliberations. The panels' conclusions and recommendation in regard to appointments were considered by the Scrutiny Committee on 31 October 2014. The committee agreed to endorse the panel's recommendation and additionally concluded that reporting back should be undertaken and that this be done by the inclusion of the organisations' minutes in the Volume of Minutes issued as part of the papers for each scheduled meeting of Council.

- 2.3 In accordance with the Scheme of Delegation the committee's recommendations were reported to the Executive for consideration. However, as the appointment of members to outside organisations is reserved to Council the Executive has referred its recommendations to Council. The report considered by the Executive is attached for reference.

2.4 The Executive agreed, on 2 December 2014, to recommend that:-

- (1) The following principles be adopted by Council in regard to the appointment of elected members to outside organisations (excluding those statutory and significant bodies set out in paragraph 2.1 above):
 - i) where there is strategic benefit to the Council in appointing to a national or regional body (such as COSLA), it would be appropriate to consider making such an appointment. However, each request should be considered on a case by case basis;
 - ii) for those organisations which fall within the Following the Public Pound regime Council does not appoint an elected member to the organisation; and
 - iii) where the organisation does not operate at a strategic level and is not funded by the Council, Council should consider each request on a case by case basis to ensure that an appointment would benefit the Council.
- (2) When appointments are made training should be available – by the organisation and/or Council to ensure that the elected members are fully able to undertake the role of Council representative.
- (3) Reporting back (to Council) should take place and should be done through the inclusion of outside organisations' minutes in the Volume of Minutes.

2.5 Additionally, if Council is minded to accept the recommendations of the Executive, it may wish to consider whether these should apply to current appointments.

3. CURRENT APPOINTMENTS

- 3.1 Traditionally Council considers its appointments to outside organisations at its statutory meeting following Local Government Elections. The next elections are in 2017. As part of its deliberations the scrutiny panel applied the principles, set out at 2.1, to current appointments and its recommendations for each, are set out in Appendix 5 of the attached report.
- 3.2 It was the panel's view that Council be invited to apply the principles with immediate effect. However, the panel was mindful of the potential impact on organisations of any decision to end an appointment and expressed the view that the transition should be managed in order that its decision does not adversely impact on the organisation – for example in terms of an organisation's constitution.
- 3.3 If Council is minded to accept the panel's recommendations in regard to current appointments it may wish to defer the effective date of its application to 31 March 2015 to allow officers to write to each organisation where Council is minded to no longer appoint and to report back to Council on 11 March 2014, on any cases where this would present a practical difficulty for an organisation.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 Council is invited to:-

- (1) consider the recommendations of the Executive in regard to the appointment of elected members on outside organisations set out at paragraph 2.4 of the report;**
- (2) consider the panel's recommendations in respect of each of the current appointments, as set out in appendix 5 of the attached report; and**
- (3) determine when any changes to appointments should be effective.**

.....
Chief Governance Officer
Date: 6 December 2014
Contact Officer: Brian Pirie ext 6110

LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 1. Scrutiny Panel file**

Any person wishing to inspect the background papers listed above should telephone Falkirk 01324 506110 and ask for Brian Pirie.

FALKIRK COUNCIL

**Subject: SCRUTINY PANEL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:
APPOINTMENT OF ELECTED MEMBERS TO OUTSIDE
ORGANISATIONS**
Meeting: EXECUTIVE
Date: 2 DECEMBER 2014
Author: CHIEF GOVERNANCE OFFICER

1. PURPOSE

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to present the scrutiny committee's recommendations in regard to its review of elected member participation on outside organisations.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 At its meeting on 14 November 2013, the scrutiny committee agreed to establish a scrutiny panel to examine the appointment of elected members to external organisations and the process for reporting to Council, in accordance with the scrutiny plan agreed by Council.
- 2.2 The panel reported its findings to the scrutiny committee on 31 October 2014, the report containing the panel's recommendations is attached to this report. The committee agreed the panel's recommendations in regard to membership which are presented to the Executive for approval.
- 2.3 In addition the scrutiny committee considered the second part of the panel's remit i.e reporting back to Council.

3. REPORTING MECHANISM

- 3.1 The panel's remit included reviewing the process for reporting back on members' participation on outside organisations. It was clear from the feedback from the surveys that both elected members and the organisations themselves see elected members' participation as a formal contact between the Council and the organisation. Currently there is no formal process of reporting.
- 3.2 The panel recognised that where an appointment is made to an outside body, in particular where the organisation has a strategic or national role, there should be a mechanism in place to allow members to feedback relevant information to Council. It agreed to consider options in this regard and to report to the next meeting of the scrutiny committee.

- 3.3 The Provost, as chair of both the committee and panel was content for the matter to be discussed by the committee on 31 October 2014. The committee agreed that where an elected member is appointed to an outside organisation it is important that reporting back should take place and that it should be done through inclusion of the outside organisation's minutes in the minute volume.

4. NEXT STEPS

- 4.1 Any decision to appoint, or remove a member, to an outside organisation is, in terms of the Scheme of Delegation, a matter for Council. It was the panel's view that Council is invited to consider its recommendations in regard to current appointments.
- 4.2 The panel considered that the principles set out in para 5.1 below should be applied to future requests for representation on outside bodies and recommends that Council adopts the principles as the basis of its approach to future appointments.
- 4.3 For current appointments the panel considered that, where Council agrees that an appointment is no longer appropriate, officers notify the organisations in question and work with them to ensure that the transition is managed and does not adversely impact on the organisation – for example if the decision impacts on the terms of the organisation's constitution or if the decision left the organisation unable to function.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 5.1 **The Executive is invited to consider the scrutiny committee's recommendations that:**
- 1) **the following principles be adopted in regard to the appointment of elected members to outside organisations:**
 - i) **where there is strategic benefit to the Council in appointing to a national or regional body (such as COSLA), it would be appropriate to consider making such an appointment. However, each request should be considered on a case by case basis;**
 - ii) **for those organisations which fall within the Following the Public Pound regime Council does not appoint an elected member to the organisation; and**
 - iii) **where the organisation does not operate at a strategic level and is not funded by the Council, Council should consider each request on a case by case basis to ensure that an appointment would benefit the Council.**
 - 2) **based on these principles, the Executive considers the recommendations in respect of current appointments, set out in appendix 5 of the appended report;**
 - 3) **when appointments are made training should be available – by the organisation and/or Council to ensure that the elected members are fully able to undertake the role of Council representative; and**

- 4) reporting back should take place and should be done through the inclusion of outside organisations' minutes in the minute volume.

.....

CHIEF GOVERNANCE OFFICER

Date: 10 November 2014

Contact: Brian Pirie, 01324 506110

LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

Any person wishing to inspect the background papers listed above should telephone Falkirk 01324 506110 and ask for Brian Pirie.

APPENDIX

FALKIRK COUNCIL

Subject: SCRUTINY PANEL – APPOINTMENT OF ELECTED MEMBERS TO OUTSIDE ORGANISATIONS
Meeting: SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
Date: 31 OCTOBER 2014
Author: CHIEF GOVERNANCE OFFICER

1. PURPOSE

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to present the scrutiny panel's recommendations in regard to elected member participation on outside organisations. A report in substantially the same form was presented to the last meeting of the committee but was continued to the present meeting. Following consultation with the Chair of the panel, a minor adjustment has been made to the recommendation and the information in Appendix 2 has been presented in a different order.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 The scrutiny panel comprised Provost Reid, Councillor Black and Councillor McLuckie. Two places reserved for members of the opposition were not taken up. The remit of the panel was to scrutinise "the appointment of elected members to outside organisations and the process for reporting to Council". This report presents the panel's recommendations in regard to the appointment of elected members on outside organisations.
- 2.2 The panel's review does not cover those appointments to boards or significant statutory bodies as set out in the report on appointments to Council on 18 May 2012. These are:-
- Central Scotland Valuation Joint Board (CSVJB)
 - Cornton Vale Over 21s Visiting Committee
 - Falkirk Community Trust Board
 - Forth Valley NHS Board
 - Fife and Forth Valley Community Justice Authority
 - SESTRAN
 - Central and West Lothian Area Support Team
 - Scotland Excel
- 2.3 In addition to appointing elected members to internal bodies such as committees and to statutory bodies (such as Fife and Forth Valley Community Justice Authority), Council also appoints elected members to various outside bodies. These include national bodies such as COSLA or local organisations such as the Braveheart Project. The panel's review focussed on the appointment of members to these organisations.

- 2.4 The appointment of members to outside organisations follows a request by an organisation for a representative of the Council to be appointed to its board/or management committee. There is no obligation to appoint members to these organisations although Council has previously sought to appoint where possible. Currently Council appoints to 36 organisations.
- 2.5 Depending on the nature of the workload and the expected involvement of the elected member on the body, appointments, particularly in cases where a member is appointed to a number of outside bodies, can have an impact on an individual member's workload which is disproportionate to the benefit to the Council of the appointment. It should be noted that although often Council chooses to appoint elected members to an organisation it can be the case that an officer could be appointed. Officer appointments are made by the relevant service.

3. REVIEW

- 3.1 The panel has met on three occasions – 24 February, 12 June and 18 August 2014. At its first meeting the panel considered the terms of its review and was provided with an information pack which set out the list of current appointments to outside bodies by both organisation and by elected member. This allowed the panel to consider the number of organisations to which appointments are made and also to look at the impact on members' workloads.
- 3.2 The panel agreed to look first at the appointment process with a view to determining whether a rationale could be applied to Council's decision making in regard to external appointments and thereafter consider the reporting mechanism.
- 3.3 For the first stage it agreed to focus on:-
- (i) the nature of the organisations to which members are appointed;
 - (ii) the role of the elected member on the body;
 - (iii) the value of the appointment to the Council;
 - (iv) the value of the appointment to the organisation;
 - (v) potential conflicts of interest; and
 - (vi) the impact of the appointment on members' workload.
- 3.4 The panel agreed, as part of an information gathering exercise to allow it to better consider the areas set out in para 3.3 above, to issue three surveys. These were;
- 1) **to all elected members.** The panel was keen to determine the extent to which elected members were involved with other bodies as a consequence of their position as an elected member but where this was not by formal appointment of the Council and the impact of such appointments on their workload (appendix 2);
 - 2) **to the external organisations** – the purpose of this survey was to determine the rationale for requesting the appointment of an elected member to their board/committee, the role of the elected member and the value in having an elected member on the board/committee. The panel also sought information on potential areas of conflict which may arise from having an elected member on a board/committee (appendix 3); and

3) **to those elected members appointed to outside bodies.** The panel surveyed those elected members appointed to outside bodies to determine their perspective on their role and the value it brings to both the Council and the organisation (appendix 4).

3.5 Of the three questionnaires - 9 of the 32 elected members responded to survey 1; 11 of 26 bodies responded to survey 2; and 27 (from a possible 53) responses were received in regard to survey 3.

3.6 While there was a range of feedback a number of broad themes emerged:-

- members' roles can range from directors or trustees to board/committee members. Some organisations perceive a value in having a representative of the Council on the board/committee. This can be because the members provide a direct link to Council and can act as a conduit for two way communication between the bodies. However, interestingly, responses suggested other motivations – elected members may be sought in order to represent the Council's position on matters or as representatives of the community and as such organisations value their status of 'spokesperson' for a geographical area (particularly where the organisation is local). Another reason for seeking a member on the board/committee can be that members bring particular skills/experience/insight in a particular subject which may be of value to the organisation (and as such the appointment is of value to the organisation but not necessarily to the Council);
- members' considered that their role was to - 'impart information'; 'allow the organisations to access information/funding'; 'promote the Council'; 'act as a link'; 'reflect the aspirations of the community'; 'highlight the work of the Council to the organisation'; and 'act as a point of contact';
- the constitutions of a number of outside bodies specifically require that its board/committee includes a representative of Falkirk Council. A number of organisations responded that this was an historic requirement and that it would not be an impediment should the Council no longer appoint to their board etc. A number of organisations also noted that the representative need not be an elected member. In one case the appointment of members was a statutory requirement;
- members' workload can be such that they do not regularly attend meetings of outside bodies and so the value to the organisation in an appointment is diminished;
- some members felt that their appointments benefitted their personal development and enabled them to learn new skills.

4. THE SCRUTINY PANEL'S CONCLUSIONS

4.1 The panel met on 12 June 2014 to consider the feedback from the surveys and information pack which had been circulated at its first meeting. It concluded that a number of general principles could apply to the appointment of elected members to outside organisations. These are :-

- (1) The organisations can be broadly categorised as:-
 - a) National or regional bodies where representation is at a strategic level and the relationship benefits the Council at a strategic and/or political level such as COSLA;
 - b) organisations which are fully or partially funded by Falkirk Council such as the Falkirk Environment Trust (FET) and which fall within the Following the Public Pound framework; and
 - c) organisations which are not funded by the Council and which operate at the community or local level - such as Falkirk Temperance Trust.
- (2) where there is a strategic benefit to the Council in appointing to a national or regional body (such as COSLA), it would be appropriate to consider making such an appointment. However, each request should be considered on a case by case basis;
- (3) for those organisations which fall within the Following the Public Pound regime, a monitoring officer is appointed to the organisation by the Council and given this there is no value to the Council in appointing an elected member. Such an approach would avoid generating conflicts of interest and enable elected members to fully participate in the scrutiny of such organisations;
- (4) where the organisation does not operate at a strategic level and is not funded/part-funded by the Council, it should consider each request on a case by case basis to ensure that an appointment would benefit the Council. However if the organisation is aware of an elected member with a particular interest in its work there would be nothing to prevent the organisation making a direct approach to the elected member. In such a case he/she would not be a representative of the Council.

- 4.2 With these general principles in mind, the panel reviewed the list of current appointments. Appendix 5 sets out those organisations to which the Council currently appoints members, with column D showing the panel's recommendations in regard to the current appointments.
- 4.3 Any decision to appoint, or remove a member, to an outside organisation is, in terms of the Scheme of Delegation, a matter for Council. It was the panel's view that Council is invited to consider its recommendations in regard to current appointments.
- 4.4 The panel considered that the principles set out in para 4.1 above should be applied to future requests for representation on outside bodies and recommends that Council adopts the principles as the basis of its approach to future appointments. For current appointments the panel considered that, where Council agrees that an appointment is no longer appropriate, officers notify the organisations in question and work with them to ensure that the transition is managed and does not adversely impact on the organisation – for example if the decision impacts on the terms of the organisation's constitution or if the decision left the organisation unable to function.

- 4.5 The panel also discussed the process by which Council makes its appointments to organisations and considered that the information provided to Council should include the following – the role of the organisation, the role of the elected member on the body, their responsibilities, likely time commitment and general background to the organisation including any relevant financial background. This, members felt, would better allow Council to align members' positions within the Council, skills and experience to the external appointments and in particular to align portfolio holder roles with appointments to relevant strategic national and regional organisations (e.g. COSLA). Future reports to Council in regard to appointments to outside organisations will include this information.
- 4.6 On a final point members considered that where appointments are made training should be available – by the organisation and/or by the Council to ensure that the elected members are fully able to undertake the role of Council representative.

5. FURTHERWORK

- 5.1 The panel's remit included reviewing the process for reporting back on members' participation on outside organisations. It was clear from the feedback from the surveys that both the elected members and the organisations themselves see elected members' participation as a formal contact between the Council and the organisation. In reality there is little feedback to Council and elected members contribution to the organisations is largely unknown. Currently there is no formal process although an informal mechanism by which a volume of minutes is prepared and provided is in place.
- 5.2 The panel recognised that where an appointment is made to an outside body, there should be a mechanism in place to allow members to feedback relevant information to Council. It agreed to consider options in this regard and to report to the next meeting of the committee

6. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 6.1 The panel agreed, at its meeting on 18 August 2014, to recommend the following principles in regard to the appointment of elected members of outside organisations:-
- (i) where there is a strategic benefit to the Council in appointing to a national or regional body (such as COSLA), it would be appropriate to consider making such an appointment. However, each request should be considered on a case by case basis;
 - (ii) for those organisations which fall within the Following the Public Pound regime Council does not appoint an elected member to the organisation; and
 - (iii) where the organisation does not operate at a strategic level and is not funded/part-funded by the Council, Council should consider each request on a case by case basis to ensure that an appointment would benefit the Council.

6.2 The panel also agreed to recommend that:-

- (i) based on these principles, Committee considers the recommendations in respect of current appointments, set out in appendix 5 of the report; and
- (ii) when appointments are made training should be available – by the organisation and/or by the Council to ensure that the elected members are fully able to undertake the role of Council representative.

The scrutiny committee is invited to consider the panel's conclusions and recommendations and to make recommendations to the Executive accordingly.

.....
Chief Governance Officer
Date: 22 October 2014
Contact Officer: Brian Pirie
Telephone: 01324 506110

LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

Notes of scrutiny panel meetings

Appendix 1

Name of Organisation/Body	Member(s) Appointed	Date of Appointment
Age Concern (Falkirk)	Depute Provost John Patrick	18 May 2012
All of Scotland Group 2014	No Appointment	
Association for Public Service Excellence	Councillor Gerry Goldie	18 May 2012
Bid Management Group	Councillor Dennis Goldie, Councillor Linda Gow (sub)	18 May 2012
Braveheart Project	Councillor Charles MacDonald (resigned 25 September 2013), Councillor Allyson Black (appointed 25 September 2013)	25 September 2013
Central Scotland Regional Equality Council	Councillor Alan Nimmo	18 May 2012
Citizens Advice Bureau (Denny & Dunipace)	Councillor Jim Blackwood, Councillor John McNally	18 May 2012
Citizens Advice Bureau (Grangemouth & Bo'ness)	Councillor Allyson Black, Councillor Adrian Mahoney	18 May 2012
Cosla (Convention of Local Authorities)	Depute Provost John Patrick, Councillor David Alexander, Councillor Linda Gow, Councillor Craig Martin	18 May 2012
Cosla Community Wellbeing and Safety Executive Group	Councillor Gerry Goldie, Councillor Allyson Black (Sub)	26 Sept 2012
Cosla Community Well-being Executive Group	Councillor Linda Gow, Councillor Allyson Black (sub)	26 Sept 2012
Cosla Culture and Sport Executive Group	Councillor Adrian Mahoney (Culture), Councillor Dr Craig R Martin (Sport)	5 December 2012
Cosla Development, Economy & Sustainability Executive Committee	Councillor Dennis Goldie, Councillor Adrian Mahoney (sub)	26 Sept 2012
Cosla Education Children and Young People Executive Group	Councillor Alan Nimmo, Provost Pat Reid (sub)	26 Sept 2012
Cosla Resources and Capacity Executive Group	Depute Provost John Patrick, Councillor Jim Blackwood (sub)	26 Sept 2012
Cosla Strategic Human Resources Management Executive Group	Councillor Dr Craig R Martin, Councillor Charles MacDonald (Sub)	26 Sept 2012
Council for Voluntary Sector Management Committee (CVS)	Councillor Rosie Murray	18 May 2012
East of Scotland European Consortium	Councillor Martin Oliver	25 September 2013
Falkirk & District Arts and Civic Council	Provost Pat Reid, Councillor John McLuckie, Baillie Joan Paterson	18 May 2012
Falkirk & District Community Safety Panel	Councillor Craig R Martin (resigned 26 February 2013) Councillor Jim Blackwood (appointed 26 June 2013)	18 May 2012

Falkirk & District Town Centre Management Ltd (now Falkirk Towns Ltd)	Councillor Allyson Black	18 May 2012
Falkirk District Twinning Association	Provost Pat Reid, Depute Provost John Patrick, Councillor Dennis Goldie and Councillor Linda Gow	18 May 2012
Falkirk Environment Trust (FET)	Councillor John McLuckie	18 May 2012
Falkirk Football Community Foundation	Councillor Craig Martin	18 May 2012
Falkirk Sports Council	Councillor Jim Blackwood	18 May 2012
Falkirk Temperance Trust	Provost Pat Reid, Councillor Dr Craig R Martin	18 May 2012
Forth Valley Area Tourism Partnership	Councillor Adrian Mahoney	18 May 2012
Forth Valley NHS Falkirk Community Health Partnership	Councillor Allyson Black, Councillor Linda Gow	20 June 2012
Highland Reserve Forces and Cadets Association	Councillor Allyson Black	20 June 2012
Museums Galleries Scotland	Councillor Adrian Mahoney	18 May 2012
National Association of Councillors	No Nominations	
Order of Malta Dial-a-Journey Ltd and Shopmobility Ltd	Councillor Colin Chalmers	20 June 2012
Paragon Housing Association Ltd	Baillie Joan Paterson	18 May 2012
Scottish Accident Prevention Council	No nominations made	
Scottish Councils Committee on Radioactive Substances	Councillor Dr Craig R Martin	18 May 2012
Scottish Enterprise East Region Advisory Board	Councillor Craig Martin	18 May 2012
Scottish Local Government Forum Against Poverty	Baillie Joan Paterson	18 May 2012
Scottish Parliament Cross Party Group on Supporting Veterans in Scotland	Depute Provost John Patrick	18 May 2012
Scottish Railway Preservation Society	Councillor Sandy Turner	18 May 2012
Scottish Schools Education Research Centre (SSERC)	Councillor Alan Nimmo	18 May 2012
Stirlingshire Educational Trust	Provost Pat Reid, Depute Provost John Patrick, Baillie Joan Paterson, Councillor Steven Carleschi, Councillor Colin Chalmers, Councillor Thomas Coleman and Councillor Alan Nimmo	18 May 2012
University of Stirling Conference	Provost Pat Reid	18 May 2012
Workers Educational Association	Councillor Dennis Goldie	18 May 2012

Appendix 2

Good afternoon,

As you will be aware the scrutiny committee recently established a scrutiny panel to review the appointment of elected members to outside organisations. The panel, which comprises of Provost Pat Reid, and Councillors Allyson Black and John McLuckie, will also look at the process whereby members report back to the Council on their involvement.

The panel is in the process of gathering background information and has requested that 3 surveys are carried out – (1) with those members **appointed by the Council** to external organisations, (2) with the external organisations themselves, and (3) with all elected members. The purpose of the third survey is to ascertain the extent of elected member involvement in other outside bodies, where their involvement is a consequence of their position as an elected member but is not through a formal Council appointment. For clarification – this does not include organisations such as parent councils or community councils but rather covers bodies on which members are invited to join because of their position as an elected member.

In particular, the panel would like to determine the extent of such appointments and the impact these have on members' time and workload.

This email is for all elected members - the survey in regard to formal appointments will be issued separately (if you have not been appointed by Council to an outside organisation you will not receive a survey form)

The questions below are in regard to membership of outside bodies which are **not** by Council appointment, but are as a consequence of your role as an elected member. This will provide useful background context for the panel in terms of the extent to which members, through their roles, are requested to sit on outside bodies, and also the impact of these in terms of time commitment.

I would be grateful if you could complete the short questionnaire below. It would assist if you could respond by **Friday 14 March**.

Please feel free to contact me if you require further information on this request by the scrutiny panel.

Brian

- 1) **Which organisations are you a member of as a consequence of your role as an elected member? (If none, please state)**
- 2) **For each organisation (if applicable) what is your role?**
- 3) **For each organisation (if applicable) what is your time commitment?**
- 4) **For each organisation (if applicable) what is the impact on your workload?**

Please give your views on the value, as you see it, of your membership of such outside bodies both to the organisation itself and to you as an elected member.

Appendix 3

Good afternoon,

Falkirk Council recently established a Scrutiny Panel to review the appointment of Elected Members to outside organisations. The panel, which comprises of Provost Pat Reid, and Councillors Allyson Black and John McLuckie, will also look at the process whereby members report back to the Council on their involvement.

The panel is in the process of gathering background information and would like to hear from Elected Members and from the organisations themselves. To that end I have been asked to conduct a survey of all external organisations to which Falkirk Council currently appoints elected representatives. It may be that after considering the responses the panel would wish to speak directly to some of the organisations. I should point out that the panel has no decision making powers, but will make recommendations to the Scrutiny Committee.

The panel is interested in learning more about the rationale for Falkirk Council members being appointed to external organisations. – for example; is it a requirement of your constitution, or do you feel there is value in having an Elected Member on your board/committee, is there an alternative method in which Falkirk Council could be represented etc.

I have prepared a short series of questions, below,. which I would be grateful if you could complete and return to me by 14 March.

I appreciate that there are a great many demands on your time, but it would greatly assist the work of the panel if you were able to provide the information below.

- 1) What is the role of Falkirk Council's appointed representative to your organisation? e.g board member, director etc**
- 2) Why do you require a Falkirk Council representative – e.g. is this an historic appointment, is it a requirement of your constitution ? If it is a requirement of your constitution, what would the impact be if Falkirk Council no longer made an Elected Member appointment**
- 3) Do you feel that having an Elected Member on your board/committee has added value to your organisation?
YES/NO – please state why**
- 4) Are you aware of any conflicts of interest which arise from having an Elected Member appointed to your organisation?**
- 5) Could an alternative arrangement be made; for example an officer appointed as a representative, or an Elected Member attending as an observer only?**

**SCRUTINY PANEL
REVIEW OF EXTERNAL ORGANISATIONS
SURVEY**

Name of Organisation:

Council Appointed Representative:

1. What is your role on the organisation (e.g. Director, Committee Member etc.)?
2. What is the value to the organisation in having an elected member as the Council's representative?
3. What is the value to the Council in having an elected member as the Council's representative?
4. What, if any, is the benefit to you of your appointment?

Other: If you have any comments you wish to make about your role or the benefits in Council appointing an elected member to this body, please write below.

Please complete and return to Andrew Cassells, Democratic Services, Municipal Buildings by 4 April 2014

	A	B	C	D
1				
2	Body Name	Purpose of Organisation	Member(s) Appointed	Panel Recommendations
3	National or Regional Bodies Where Representation is at a Strategic Level and the Relationship Benefits the Council at a Strategic and/or Political Level			
4	COSLA Education Children and Young People Executive Group	COSLA Executive Group relating to Education Children and Young People.	Councillor Alan Nimmo	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to COSLA.
5	COSLA Health and Wellbeing Executive Group	COSLA Executive Group relating to Health and Wellbeing.	Councillor Linda Gow	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to COSLA.
6	COSLA Regeneration and Sustainable Development Executive Committee	COSLA Executive Group relating to Regeneration and Sustainable Development.	Councillor Dennis Goldie	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to COSLA.
7	COSLA Resources and Capacity Executive Group	COSLA Executive Group relating to Resources and Capacity.	Depute Provost John Patrick	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to COSLA.
8	COSLA Strategic Human Resources Management Executive Group	COSLA Executive Group relating to Human Resources Management.	Councillor Dr Craig R Martin	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to COSLA.
9	COSLA Community Wellbeing and Safety Executive Group.	COSLA Executive Group relating to Community Wellbeing and Safety.	Councillor Gerry Goldie	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to COSLA.
10	COSLA (Convention of Scottish Local Authorities)	National voice for local government in Scotland, responsible for setting policy and direction.	Councillor David Alexander, Councillor Linda Gow, Councillor Craig Martin and Depute Provost John Patrick	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to COSLA.
11	Scottish Enterprise East Regional Advisory Board	Economic Development.	Councillor Craig Martin	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to this organisation.
12	East of Scotland European Consortium	Establish EU Policy knowledge and information on EU funding. Lobby and petition on behalf of the East of Scotland to influence policy change. Ensure EU policy engagement. Develop collaborative EU projects between members.	Councillor Martin Oliver	That Council continues to appoint an elected member representative to this organisation.
13	Association for Public Service Excellence	To promote the public provision of high quality local services and to support authorities in their efforts to deliver continuous improvement and to oppose any unreasonable restrictions in achieving such aims. To co-ordinate the activities of direct frontline services to exchange information and experience, and to make recommendations to such bodies, with a view to identifying and disseminating best practice. To work in partnership with any organisation which shares the aims and philosophies of the Association. To monitor present legislation and any changes proposed to understand the implications, representing members and lobbying government and other bodies as appropriate.	Councillor Gerry Goldie	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.
14	Scottish Local Government Forum Against Poverty	Supports elected members in shaping services that improve the life experiences of council residents.	Baillie Joan Paterson	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.
15	Scottish Councils Committee on Radioactive Substances	Provide a mechanism to identify a common, Scottish local authority view point on radioactive waste management issues. Act as an interface with the Scottish	Councillor Dr Craig R Martin	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.
16	Forth Valley Area Tourism Partnership	Promotion/marketing of Scotland. Industry engagement.	Councillor Adrian Mahoney	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.

	A	B	C	D
1				
2	Body Name	Purpose of Organisation	Member(s) Appointed	Panel Recommendations
17	Scottish Schools Education Research Centre (SSERC)	A not-for-profit research centre and advisory body providing technical support to schools and colleges in Scotland.	Councillor Alan Nimmo	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.
18	All of Scotland Group 2014	The affairs of the Centre are governed by The purpose of the Group is to spread the benefits of the Glasgow Commonwealth Games 2014 throughout the rest of Scotland.	No nominations	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.
19	Museum Galleries Scotland	National Development Body for the museum sector in Scotland, that works to invest in and develop a sustainable museum and galleries sector for Scotland.	Councillor Adrian Mahoney	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.
20	National Association of Councillors	An organisation which represents Elected Members in all types of Local Authorities and all political persuasions.	No nominations	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.
21	Scotland Accident Prevention Council	To formulate and enhance the worth of accident prevention.	No nominations	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not strategic benefit to the Council.
22	Scottish Parliament Cross Party Veterans Group	To act as a link with veterans, veteran's charities, Scottish Parliament, Government and the Cross Party Group itself to create a more robust service of support for veterans.	Depute Provost John Patrick	This is an ex-officio appointment - Veteran's Champion. The panel recommends that Council continues to appoint to this position
23	Organisations Which Are Fully or Partially Funded by Falkirk Council and Which Fall Within the Following the Public Pound Framework			
24	Citizens Advice Bureau (Denny & Dunipace)	General advice agency. To ensure individuals do not suffer through lack of knowledge of their rights and responsibilities or of the services available or through an inability to express their needs effectively and equally. To exercise a responsible influence on the development of social policies and services locally and nationally.	Councillor Jim Blackwood, Councillor John McNally	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation as it is funded by the Council and managed through the Following the Public Pound framework.
25	Citizens Advice Bureau (Grangemouth & Bo'ness)	As above.	Councillor Allyson Black, Councillor Adrian Mahoney	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation as it is funded by the Council and managed through the Following the Public Pound framework.
26	Council for Voluntary Sector Management Committee (CVS)	Umbrella and support body for charity and voluntary sector. The Third sector interface for the Falkirk Council Area. An intermediary which supports, develops and represents the Third Sector and volunteering. The organisation is a key partner in Falkirk's Community Planning Partnership.	Councillor Rosie Murray	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation as it is funded by the Council and managed through the Following the Public Pound framework.
27	Falkirk & District Town Centre Management Ltd - now Falkirk Towns Ltd	Responsible for Management of Town Centres.	Councillor Allyson Black	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation as it is funded by the Council and managed through the Following the Public Pound framework.
28	Bid Management Group	Responsible for the Business Improvement District.	Councillor Dennis Goldie, Councillor Linda Gow (sub)	This organisation was wound up as part of a review which led to the creation of Falkirk Towns Ltd.
29	Scottish Railway Preservation Society	The advancement of railway heritage through the creation of a nationally significant museum of Scottish Railways and the operation of the Bo'ness and Kinneil Railway as a visitor attraction.	Councillor Sandy Turner	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation as it is funded by the Council and managed through the Following the Public Pound framework.
30	Workers Educational Association (Falkirk Adult Literacies Partnership)	A national, democratic adult education provider which produces community and work place based learning.	Councillor Dennis Goldie	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation as it is funded by the Council and managed through the Following the Public Pound framework.

	A	B	C	D
1				
2	Body Name	Purpose of Organisation	Member(s) Appointed	Panel Recommendations
31	Central Scotland Regional Equality Council	Voluntary organisation which brings together representatives from the statutory authorities, voluntary organisations and individuals who support the aims of the Equality Council.	Councillor Alan Nimmo	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation as it is funded by the Council and managed through the Following the Public Pound framework.
32	Falkirk Environment Trust (FET)	To distribute landfill tax monies and other sources of funding in the Falkirk Council area.	Councillor John McLuckie	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation as it is funded by the Council and managed through the Following the Public Pound framework.
33	Organisations Which Are Not Funded by the Council and Which Operate at the Community or Local Level			
34	Braveheart Project	A voluntary organisation which runs self help support groups for adults with heart problems. Volunteers are recruited and trained to run groups encouraging participants to discuss and implement changes to their lifestyle in a positive manner through sessions on healthy eating, medication, heart health, physical activity, stress and smoking cessation.	Councillor Charles MacDonald	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not sufficient benefit to the Council. The organisation may make a direct appointment with an individual member should it so wish.
35	Falkirk & District Arts and Civic Council	To encourage and stimulate interest in the promotion, understanding, performance and appreciation of the arts and related cultural and civic activities within the Falkirk Council area.	Provost Pat Reid (honorary president) , Councillor John McLuckie, Baillie Joan Paterson	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to this organisation.
36	Falkirk & District Community Safety Panel	To reduce crime and fear of crime. To promote a safe environment and encourage communities to ensure that community safety is given highest priority. To encourage the local bodies of Falkirk Council, Police, NHS and other bodies in the reduction of crime.	Councillor Dr Craig R Martin	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not sufficient benefit to the Council. The organisation may make a direct appointment with an individual member should it so wish.
37	Falkirk District Twinning Association	Develop partnership arrangements between the Falkirk District and Creteil in France, and any other such areas as may be determined at a future date. To promote cultural, social and educational exchanges in the interests of mutual friendship.	Provost Pat Reid, Depute Provost John Patrick, Councillor Dennis Goldie and Councillor Linda Gow	That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to this organisation.
38	Falkirk Sports Council	To promote interest and participation in sport in the Falkirk Council area. To encourage the work of sports clubs and organisations. To organise the annual sports awards. To distribute the grant aid funds of Falkirk Council.	Councillor Jim Blackwood	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not sufficient benefit to the Council. The organisation may make a direct appointment with an individual member should it so wish.
39	Highland Reserve Forces and Cadets Association	Representing the reserve forces and the 3 service cadet organisations (Sea, Army and Navy) in the area north of the Forth/Clyde line. Provides accommodation, support to recruiting, support to employers of reservists and support to cadets and wider youth initiatives.	Councillor Allyson Black	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not sufficient benefit to the Council. The organisation may make a direct appointment with an individual member should it so wish.
40	Order of Malta Dial-a-Journey Ltd and Shopmobility Ltd	The provision of wheelchair accessible transport and associated services.	Councillor Colin Chalmers	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not sufficient benefit to the Council. The organisation may make a direct appointment with an individual member should it so wish.
41	Paragon Housing Association Ltd	Registered social landlord. Provision of social rented housing.	Baillie Joan Paterson	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not sufficient benefit to the Council. The organisation may make a direct appointment with an individual member should it so wish.
42	Stirlingshire Educational Trust	Charitable trust awarding educational grants.	Provost Pat Reid, Depute Provost John Patrick, Baillie Buchanan, Councillors Carleschi, Chalmers, Coleman and Nimmo	This is a statutory requirement. That Council continues to appoint elected member representatives to this organization.
43	University of Stirling Conference	Higher education.	Provost Pat Reid	Council continues to appoint a representative. This is an ex-officio appointment - Provost.

	A	B	C	D
1				
2	Body Name	Purpose of Organisation	Member(s) Appointed	Panel Recommendations
44	Forth Valley NHS Falkirk Community Health Partnership	NHS Forth Valley provides a wide range of community based health services which are delivered in homes, health centres and clinics across Forth Valley. These include services delivered by health visitors, district nurses, physiotherapists, podiatrists and speech and language therapists. Services are currently managed within Community Health Partnerships which are run in partnership with local councils who are responsible for the delivery of social work and social care services.	Councillor Allyson Black, Councillor Linda Gow	Note – this body will be superceded by the Health and Social Care integration transitional board.
45	Age Concern (Falkirk)	To arrange/promote activities to improve health and wellbeing of older people via social contact and events.	Depute Provost John Patrick	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not sufficient benefit to the Council. The organisation may make a direct appointment with an individual member should it so wish.
46	Falkirk Temperance Trust	Assisting organisations and charitable bodies resident or operating in Falkirk whose purposes include working with people who are addicted to alcohol or other substances.	Provost Pat Reid, Councillor Dr Craig R Martin	Council continues to appoint to this body.
47	Falkirk Football Community Foundation	The advancement of education. Public participation in sport. Improve the provision of recreational facilities.	Councillor Craig Martin	That Council no longer appoints to this organisation. The panel considers that there is not sufficient benefit to the Council. The organisation may make a direct appointment with an individual member should it so wish.