

Appendix 1 Table of proposed Council responses to comments received on SG14: Renewable and Low Carbon Energy

Organisation	Comment	Proposed response	SG Section
SEPA (Scottish Environment Protection Agency)	The guidance is useful in its provision of detailed advice, templates, and maps to support the location of renewable and low carbon energy generation developments in appropriate places, in line with the objectives of broader policy in relation to renewable and low carbon energy as set out in the Scottish Government Energy Strategy and subsequent Position Statement.	Comment noted	Whole document
	In Section 1, Introduction, under the National Policy section we note there are references to policies and acts which have been updated since the time of drafting. We have noted several we identified below, however we recommend reviewing the document in advance of adoption to ensure all policies references are up to date as national planning and energy policy are being rapidly expanded and updated. • Energy Strategy (2017) and Energy Strategy Position Statement (2021) • National Planning Framework 4 Position Statement (2020) • Heat Networks (Scotland) Act 2021	Comment accepted. Position statements in current policies and strategies including the emerging NPF4 and the 2017 Energy Strategy will be published regularly, so the strategies are referred to generally in this document so as not to become outdated. References to Heat Networks Act are updated as follows: Update figure 3, p03 as follows: delete text and replace with “Heat Networks (Scotland) Act 2021: An Act of the Scottish Parliament to make provision for regulating the supply of heat by a heat network, and for regulating the construction, licensing and operation of a heat network.”	Section 1, Introduction Figure 3, p03
	Under Section 2. Types of Renewable and Low Carbon Technologies and Locational Guidance, the technology descriptions and the further information provided for each type is helpful. We request that in the Biomass, Hydro and Energy Recovery topics, that under the Further Information heading, links to the regulatory advice pages of our SEPA website are provided to ensure that future applicants are directed to further	Comment noted. Section 3 Development Management Guidance includes links (para 3.9) to the relevant SEPA regulatory advice.	Section 2 Section 3

	regulatory requirements which may influence their development proposals at the planning stage and encourage early engagement with SEPA on these issues.		
	We note that there is a reference to Hydrogen contained within the Energy Storage section of Section 2. The Scottish Government recently published a Hydrogen Policy Statement (2020) which outlines their commitment to making (green) hydrogen a key element of Scotland's decarbonisation plans and identifies those policies which will be focussed on support for the development of a low-cost hydrogen capability to meet an initial ambition of generating 5GW of renewable and low-carbon hydrogen by 2030. As a result of a favourable policy environment and new allocated funding, it is likely green hydrogen production facilities are likely to increase in number across Scotland, therefore there may be value in reviewing the Hydrogen Policy Statement and Action Plan, against the proposed policy position and information requirements provided in the SG to ensure that the council is content that the provision in the document is appropriate for their objectives. We also request that in the Energy Storage topic, a Further Information heading is added to include advice to engage SEPA as early as possible in proposals involving hydrogen production for further regulatory advice.	Comment accepted. Add new paragraphs in Section 2 as follows: "Hydrogen Production <u>Description of Technology</u> 2.71. Hydrogen is a clean fuel that, when consumed in a fuel cell, produces only water. Hydrogen can be produced from natural gas, nuclear power, biomass, and renewable power like solar and wind. In broad terms there are three types of hydrogen production: Grey Hydrogen – is produced from the reforming of natural gas. This process produces both hydrogen and carbon dioxide. Blue (or low-carbon) Hydrogen – is produced in the same way as grey hydrogen but the process is aligned with CCS systems which capture most of the CO2 produced, preventing it from entering the atmosphere and storing it safely in deep geological formations. Green Hydrogen – is produced from the electrolysis of water, a process which splits water into its constituent parts of hydrogen and oxygen. When renewably sourced electricity is used this process is completely green." 2.72. At present, hydrogen is an evolving technology. The Scottish Government have published a Position Statement Scottish Government Hydrogen Policy Statement - gov.scot (www.gov.scot) setting out	Section 2 Para 2.56, p18 Paras 2.70 onwards, p23

		significant investment into development. This reflects the UK government approach. <u>Locational Guidance</u> 2.73. The Scottish Government Position Statement highlights that the Grangemouth cluster already produces and consumes large quantities of hydrogen, positioning the region as a potential future hub of low carbon hydrogen supply and demand. There is substantial capacity for the industries in this area to capitalise on their location, skills and expertise, pooling their collective demand for low-carbon energy or working together to advance the early development of low-carbon infrastructure at scale. This is likely to link in with the area’s Carbon Capture potential, and the capture of industrial emissions.” Add additional sentence at the end of paragraph 2.56, p18: “Early engagement with SEPA should be sought for proposals involving hydrogen production and/or storage.”	
	We note that there is only one reference to Local Heat and Energy Efficiency Strategies (LHEES) within the document. We appreciate that the implementation of LHEES is yet to commence and therefore it is complex to begin the integration of strategies which contain spatial information and policy guidance regarding the development opportunities for Renewable and Low Carbon Energy. However as outlined in the Heat in Buildings Strategy (Draft) (Feb 2021) LHEES documents will provide a framework for taking an area-based	Comment accepted. Insert sentence at end of para 2.62 as follows: “Falkirk’s LHEES will provide a framework for taking an area-based approach to heat and energy efficiency planning and delivery. LHEES will be in place in all Local Authority areas by the end of 2023. The emerging Scottish Government Heat in Buildings Strategy provides the framework for LHEES moving	Section 2 – para 2.62, p19

	approach to heat and energy efficiency planning and delivery, and their development processes will provide an important platform to consider both local community and wider national infrastructure issues. As a result, it is important that the SG14 document is cognisant of LHEES and potential opportunities for identifying and delivering energy generation proposals in the right place and appropriate policy levers are embedded within the document as far the council sees fit.	forward. Energy Statements will also be required to reflect the LHEES when identifying potential opportunities for district heat or other renewable and low-carbon technologies.”	
	In paragraph 2.48 Heat Recovery, 2nd bullet point refers to recovering heat from Effluent Streams. This should include heat from sewers/waste water treatment too (unless heat from water is elsewhere and covers this). We note that the case study refers to the Stirling Energy Centre that takes heat from Scottish Water waste water treatment works.	Comment accepted. Delete 2nd bullet point and insert “Waste Heat from Effluent Streams (such as sewers/waste water, or from food and drink or textile manufacturing);”	Para 2.48, p17
	Paragraph 2.58 – we recommend a change to terminology. The SG states “the term ‘decentralised energy network’ is also known as a district heat network” – this isn’t strictly true. A decentralised energy network can also cover private power network (so electricity for power rather than heat). We would suggest it is changed to “the term ‘decentralised energy network’ includes district heat networks”.	Comment accepted. Delete 1st sentence in para 2.58 and replace with “The term ‘decentralised energy network’ also includes district heat networks, as well as a private power network for delivering electricity.”	Para 2.58, p19
	We recommend referring to peat and carbon rich soils (paragraph 2.13 Other Relevant Areas of Constraint) with a separate heading specific for this issue. A separate title would highlight the importance of avoidance of disturbance of peat and carbon rich soils in the context of the climate emergency.	Comments noted and partly accepted. Replace title “Other Relevant Areas of Constraint” in para 2.13 with “Peat and Carbon Rich Soils”. Insert new title “Other Relevant Areas of Constraint” above para 2.14.	Para 2.13-2.14, p10.

	We also recommend expanding on the reasons for the avoidance of disturbance instead of just referring to Section 3 for the potential impacts. Section 3 could also explain the preference for excavated peat to be re-used as peat, as reuse in peatland restoration or land improvement would be preferable to disposal to landfill.	With regards to peat, the table in Section 2.17 clearly sets out impacts arising from the loss or disturbance of peat. Further information on the re-use of excavated peat can be included as follows: Insert new sentence after 3rd sentence in 'Supporting Information required' as follows: "There is a preference for any excavated peat to be re-used as peat, as reuse in peatland restoration or land improvement rather than being disposed of to landfill."	Table 3.17, p32
	We recommend that the potential impact on Groundwater Dependent Terrestrial Ecosystems (GWDTEs) is highlighted in Section 3 in the section 'Scale of potential impacts from applicable proposals' for wind farms and hydro. We note that there is reference to LUPS SEPA Guidance Note 31 (Guidance on Assessing the Impacts of Development Proposals on Groundwater Abstractions and Groundwater Dependent Terrestrial Ecosystems), however it would be useful if the text would also refer to GWDTEs.	Comment accepted. Insert new sentence at end of 'Wind' Section in table 3.16: "Wind energy development can have potentially significant impacts on Groundwater Dependent Terrestrial Ecosystems through construction, pollution or any activities or engineering operations which may disrupt groundwater flow." Insert new sentence at end of 'Hydro' Section in table 3.16: "Hydro development can have potentially significant impacts on Groundwater Dependent Terrestrial Ecosystems through construction, pollution or any activities or engineering operations which may disrupt groundwater flow."	Section 3.16, p31
	Appendix 1 map 8 - Carbon Rich and Rare Soils including Prime Agricultural Land - Because this map includes prime agricultural land it is difficult to see if all categories of carbon rich and deep peat soils have	Comment noted. Map 8 reflects the 2016 dataset which includes Class 5 peat soil.	Appendix 1, Map 8

	been included. It is important that the selection of soil includes also Category 5 (previously called X). This is often left out because the vegetation cover does not indicate peatland habitat, however all soils are carbon-rich soil and deep peat. Carbon and Peatland 2016 map and consultation analysis report. (Nature.scot)	No change proposed.	
Historic Environment Scotland	We welcome that the guidance and advice relating to the historic environment has been carried forward and updated from the previously adopted documents and consolidated in the new guidance. We remain of the view that the information and advice contained within the document offers robust guidance on the consideration of the historic environment in project development and decision making.	Comments noted.	Whole document
Coal Authority	No specific comment to make.	Comment noted.	Whole document.
NatureScot (Formerly Scottish Natural Heritage)	We understand that this update of the Supplementary Guidance brings together previously separate Supplementary Guidance on these topics into one resource. We welcome this change and, in common with those older documents, we consider that the draft is a succinct and clear piece of guidance. The inclusion of case studies that are locally relevant adds to a document that seems likely to be highly useful to stakeholders.	Comment noted.	Whole document.
Pat Mason	Pat Mason states that the document under review is a policy document, which talks about principles rather than specifics and it is hard to relate to everyday life. Pat Mason is supportive of 'green' energy which should be encouraged and used wherever possible. Particular support is given for Solar PV and energy	Comments noted. The SG is intended to be a guide for developers on the implementation of LDP2 policy in respect of integrating renewable and low carbon energy into new development. The SG also provides guidance for stand-alone energy projects in terms of location	Whole document.

	storage, heat pumps with regulatory requirements in countries such as Portugal cited. National and Local Planning policy should reflect this. Comments make reference to the importance of a sustainable energy supply, and the capacity of the grid to accommodate energy generation. Comments also make reference to the need for home insulation to address fuel poverty. Comments state that electric vehicle charging points should become standard on homes where there is off road parking (to avoid trip hazards across pavements) and arrangements for electric vehicles where there is no off-road parking may be problematic but should be considered. Home insulation and energy efficiency should be encouraged and supported as much as possible. The recent row over excessive energy bills in Braes villages are an example of how things can go wrong, and it should be a priority to plan for prevention of this situation arising, with remedial measures a priority.	guidance and considerations. The SG reflects national policy, as well as Development Plan policy in terms of enabling and promoting renewable and low carbon energy development. In terms of comments on home energy and energy efficiency, specific requirements for new and existing development are largely set out in building standards, as well as national standards for public buildings and procurement. The emerging Scottish Government 2021 New Build Heat Standard will also require new build properties to provide net-zero carbon heating systems from 2024. The SG provides new guidance and standards on EV provision in Sections 4.11-4.16. Developers are expected to future-proof new developments by providing charging infrastructure within curtilage of new domestic properties, and within the parking areas for business and community developments. Para 4.17, p44 sets out the Council's standards for EV provision for new development. It is important to note that for detached dwellings, developers may only include the cabling/ducting for connections, rather than the connection point itself, although with the rapid growth in electric vehicles, many housebuilders are likely to provide EV charge points to meet market demand. No change proposed.	Sections 4.11-4.16, p43
Elaine Mackie	Ms Mackie raises concerns about the volume of traffic in around schools generated through pick up/drop off.	Comments noted. School travel planning and transport falls outwith the scope of this SG. No change proposed.	Whole document.

			Whole Document
	<u>Section – Local Energy Policy and Guidance (p5)</u> Recommend this section make reference to the Local Heat and Energy Efficiency Strategy (LHEES) pilot undertaken by Falkirk Council, and any further work being carried out ahead of the Scottish Government’s stated ambition to have LHEES in place across all local authority areas by the end of 2023.	Comment accepted. Insert new paragraph after para 1.14: “Falkirk Council is in the early stages of producing a Council-wide Local Heat and Energy Efficiency Strategy (LHEES), having taken part in the Scottish Government initial pilot scheme. This will provide a framework for taking an area-based approach to heat and energy efficiency planning and delivery.”	Section 1 Para 1.14 P5
	<u>Section – IR13 Low and Zero Carbon Development (p7 & p41)</u> For awareness – see the draft Heat in Buildings Strategy (https://www.gov.scot/publications/heat-buildings-strategy-achieving-net-zero-emissions-scotlands-buildings-consultation/). In particular noting the upcoming 2021 New Build Heat Standard, which will require new buildings consented from 2024 to use zero emissions heating (and cooling), initially applying to new homes - with similar requirements to be phased-in from 2024 for new non-domestic buildings, and the Net Zero Carbon Public Buildings Standard.	Comment noted.	Section 1.
	<u>Section – IR14 Heat Networks (p7)</u> For awareness - Heat Networks (Scotland) Act 2021 (https://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2021/9/enacted). In particular noting Part 3, which places a duty on local authorities to review heat networks zoning in their area.	Comment for information noted. LHEES now addressed in para 2.62.	Section 2, para 2.62, p19
	P15 – Biomass	Comment accepted.	Section 2, Para 2.40, p15

	• Should refer to the Biomass Policy Statement and Cleaner Air For Scotland Strategy, in particular for the approach to bioenergy for heat to minimise impacts on local air quality. • Bioenergy Update: Bioenergy: update - March 2021 - gov.scot (www.gov.scot) • Cleaner Air For Scotland 2: Cleaner Air for Scotland 2 - Towards a Better Place for Everyone - gov.scot (www.gov.scot)	Insert new sentence at the start of para 2.40, p15: “The Bioenergy: Update report produced in March 2020 sets out the Scottish Government’s intentions for delivering a strategic framework for bioenergy, and how progress will be made over the next 18-24 months. A new air quality strategy to replace Cleaner Air for Scotland - The Road to a Healthier Future, also sets out the Scottish Government’s air quality policy framework for the next five years and a series of actions to deliver further air quality improvements.”	
Grangemouth Chemical Cluster Companies	IR13. LOW AND ZERO CARBON DEVELOPMENT. The Supplementary Guidance should recognise approved Government policy and not go beyond it. Consequently, the various references to increases in the proportions of the overall reduction in CO2 emissions as required by Building Standards that have been achieved via on-site low and zero carbon generating technologies are viewed with concern. See IR 13. Low and Zero Carbon Development. Section 1 Page 7 and Paragraph 4.2 Page 41 where it is suggested that there will be increases in proportions in subsequent reviews of the Local Development Plan before these reviews have even been consulted upon. These references are objected to and should be deleted.	Comment noted. LDP2 Policy IR13 and SG14 reflect the requirements of National Energy Policy and Scottish Planning Policy, as well as Section 72 of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 and inserted into Section 3F of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997. The Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 requires that “A planning authority, in any local development plan prepared by them, must include policies requiring all developments in the local development plan area to be designed so as to ensure that all new buildings avoid a specified and rising proportion of the projected greenhouse gas emissions from their use, calculated on the basis of the approved design and plans for the specific development, through the installation and operation of low and zero-carbon generating technologies.” This means that the proportion as required in LDP2 policy must be periodically reviewed and increased. This is generally done through each new Development Plan cycle.	

		No change proposed.	
	TGCCC operate in a highly competitive global environment. Consequently, it is essential that these companies are not disadvantaged by the impact of sustainability requirements. Therefore, a new Paragraph should be inserted in IR13 to read: <i>“The economic impact of sustainability requirements on businesses will be taken into account particularly in relation to energy costs and global competitiveness.”</i>	Comment noted. It is not within the scope of this document to amend existing Development Plan Policy. The requirements are not onerous in the context of the drive towards net zero carbon and are mandatory through the requirements of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009. The specified reduction in emissions in the policy remains at a modest level and is also needed to drive national and local aspirations to net zero carbon. The policy is related to new development and buildings rather than the existing or new industrial processes which may take place within sites. No change proposed.	
	IR 14. 2. HEAT NETWORKS. Page 7. The proposal that developers should future proof their sites with the installation of pipework to the curtilage of development and the safeguarding of pipelines within developments is viewed with concern as it is impractical within the confines of the companies’ chemical sites. It should only be required where there is firm evidence that a future heat network is a realistic possibility. Firm evidence is required to justify the provision and safeguarding of expensive infrastructure within chemical sites. Heat is a vital component for some industrial sites especially in the chemical sector.	Comment noted. It is not within the scope of this document to amend existing Development Plan Policy. Policy IR14 and SG14 set out the requirement for development sites to be futureproofed with district heat infrastructure where possible. Developers will be required to submit an Energy Statement, which will address any practical or economic viability considerations in terms of whether infrastructure can be provided. No change proposed.	

	This Policy should recognise that sites may not have spare capacity for any district heating network. Progress on the district heating network also needs to be made in the near future to enable companies to incorporate this into energy planning. Policy IR 14.2 is objected to in its present form and if not revised and the subject of further consultation should be deleted.		
	GRANGEMOUTH ENERGY PROJECT. Paragraphs 2.53 Pages 17 and 2.62 Page 19 both refer to the Grangemouth Energy Project. The text notes that although the project has stalled opportunities are still being pursued in conjunction with Falkirk and Grangemouth Investment Zone Growth Deal. Paragraph 2.62 states that Falkirk Council is in the early stages of producing a Council –wide Local Heat and Energy Efficiency Strategy (LHEES), having taken part in the Scottish Government initial pilot scheme. TGCCC note these initiatives by Falkirk Council but wish to be fully consulted on any initiatives that could compromise the competitiveness of their operations.	Comment noted. Falkirk Council are committed to engagement and consultation on relevant Council policy and strategy relating to heat and energy, as well as the Grangemouth Investment Zone. Stakeholders include Grangemouth Chemical Cluster Companies, as well as other business interests, stakeholders and community groups.	
	SG 14 should contain support for Gas Combined Heat and Power plants. This would recognise the need for a balanced energy portfolio and the needs of companies to generate onsite electricity and heat.	Comment noted. Paragraph 2.59 identifies CHP run from natural gas as falling within the scope of SG14 on the basis that the technology can be potentially considered a low-carbon technology. LDP2 policy and SG14 acknowledge the	Section 2, para 2.59, p19

		need for some technologies to be run from non-renewable fuels for an interim period, prior to the transition to renewable energy sources in the future. No change proposed.	
	Paragraph 4.7 Page 43 refers to the Appendix 4 Energy Statement Template. The Template is to be completed and updated at two stages in the planning application process. Implementation will be addressed through planning conditions which will form part of the consent. TGCCC object to the disproportionately costly and complex nature of the template and the information required within it. It should be deleted.	Comment noted. The Energy Statement Template is intended to be a guide to enable developers to assemble the information required for an Energy Statement, and to demonstrate compliance with the LZCGT requirements. These are already LDP2 policy requirements. The template does not require further information over and above this. No change proposed.	Paragraph 4, p43
West Lothian Council	No specific comments.	Comment noted.	Whole document.