

Appendix 1

Denny Town Centre Regeneration : Options Summary

Option	Type	Up Front Capital Cost	Degree of ongoing maintenance & monitoring	Advantages	Disadvantages
1	Ramp	£275k	Medium	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintenance & monitoring costs lower than lift options 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Highest capital cost. ▪ Distance to walk is generally longer than the route around the town square (option 5) ▪ Loss of retail space to accommodate structure ▪ Loss of retail frontage creating a poor streetscape ▪ Diverts the public away from the commercial main street to a less safe remote route to the carpark.
2	Combined Lift within Phase 1	£158k	High	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provides additional means of access for disabled members of the public within the hours of operation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Conflict between use as goods and public lift ▪ Combined lift will have higher maintenance costs ▪ Public use will be restricted by goods operation ▪ Potential for vandalism ▪ Opportunity for public access to restricted service areas with further possibility of vandalism and break-ins ▪ High management and maintenance costs ▪ Given no on-site management, emergencies will take time to respond to causing potential health and safety incident. ▪ Restricted timing of operation given no on-site management ▪ Tenant interest in Phase 1 may be limited given the above issues and potential additional service charge costs ▪ Entrance lobby provides an opportunity for criminality

3	Separate Public Lift within phase 1	£178k	High	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides additional means of access for disabled members of the public within the hours of operation. No conflict between goods and public use 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential for vandalism Opportunity for public access to restricted service areas with further possibility of vandalism and break-ins High management and maintenance costs Given no on-site management, emergencies will take time to respond to causing potential health and safety incident. Restricted timing of operation given no on-site management Tenant interest in Phase 1 may be limited given the above issues and potential excessive service charge costs Entrance lobby provides an opportunity for criminality
4	External Lift	£200k	High	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides additional means of access for disabled members of the public within the hours of operation. No conflict between goods and public use No affect on management of phase 1 as completely independent of the property 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Given external position likely to have high probability of excessive vandalism High management and maintenance costs Given no on-site management, emergencies will take time to respond to causing potential health and safety incident. Restricted timing of operation given no on-site management Entrance lobby provides an opportunity for criminality
5	No Change to Detailed Application	Nil	Nil	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No capital cost No management & monitoring costs No additional vandalism issues No on-site management required Design takes the public past the commercial properties in the route to the carpark which is safer and helps the retail offer No negative affect on retailer interest in phase 1 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Access for disabled is not as direct as lift options